

Comparative Evaluation of UMMI and At-Tartili Methods in Elementary Quranic Literacy Using the CIPP Model

Nurul Hidayah¹, Luk-Luk Nur Mufidah^{2✉}, Luluk Indarti³

^{1,2,3} Universitas Islam Negeri Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah Tulungagung, Indonesia

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.28926/pej.v6i1.2653>

Abstract

The ability to read and write the Quran (BTQ) is an essential skill in elementary education, vital for cultivating a fluent and rhythmic generation of Quranic scholars. The UMMI and At-Tartili systems are two prevalent approaches, each emphasizing distinct aspects: reading fluency and accuracy. This study seeks to assess and contrast the efficacy of both methodologies utilizing the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model. A mixed-methods approach was used to gather data through observations, interviews, and student reading assessments at two madrasahs in Kediri Regency. The research findings indicate that the UMMI approach significantly enhances students' reading fluency and motivation, whereas the At-Tartili method demonstrates superiority in tajwid accuracy and reading quality. Context and input assessment indicated resource preparedness for method implementation; however, process elements require enhancement, especially in terms of learning differentiation. This discovery advocates for the creation of a hybrid model that amalgamates the advantages of both methodologies to enhance the efficacy and equilibrium of BTQ learning. This study advances the creation of an evidence-based Quranic learning model pertinent to madrasah education.

Keywords: *Al-Quran Education, UMMI Method, At-Tartili Method, CIPP Framework, Primary Education*

INTRODUCTION

The Quran is the principal source of Islamic doctrine, functioning as both a guide for worship and a moral and social framework for human existence. The capacity to recite the Quran with tartil is the primary avenue to comprehending its significance and assimilating its principles. Surah Al-Muzzammil, verse 4, commands "*wa rattilil-qur'āna tartilā,*" underscoring the need of reciting the Quran with accuracy and structure. Reading with accurate pronunciation transcends mere technicality; it embodies a spiritual significance that imparts discipline, meticulousness, and reverence for the words of God. This perspective corresponds with the principle of Islamic character education, which asserts that the educational process must cultivate not only intellect but also emotional depth and ethical behavior.

✉ Corresponding author: Luk-Luk Nur Mufidah

Email Address: nurmufidah@uinsatu.ac.id

Received: 26 January 2026, Revised: 15 February, Published: 20 March 2026

In a worldwide perspective, Quran literacy exemplifies spiritual education that cultivates pupils' religious intelligence. These abilities include cognitive elements (understanding of letters and reading principles), psychomotor skills (precision of pronunciation), and emotive domains (appreciation of Qur'anic ethical standards). Regrettably, numerous studies indicate a disparity between the ideal and the actual circumstances. (Indonesia, 2020) discovered that over fifty percent of elementary madrasah pupils are unable to read the Quran fluently and accurately. (Ahsanul, 2020) revealed a comparable conclusion, indicating that proficiency in articulating letters (*makhraj*) in BTQ learning in East Java remains inadequate. (Rahmawati, 2022) research indicates that certain educators lack a comprehensive understanding of the steps involved in efficient Quranic learning methodologies.

This inadequate performance indicates systemic problems in the execution of BTQ learning within madrasahs. The BTQ curriculum remains normative as it primarily focuses on technical reading proficiency and has not incorporated the development of Qur'anic attitudes. The pedagogical competency of Al-Qur'an educators requires enhancement, since the majority of the teaching personnel lack systematic method certification training. Third, the pedagogical methods employed are inconsistent; certain madrasahs utilize a traditional approach grounded in *Iqra'*, but others implement the UMMI, *Tilawati*, or *At-Tartil* methodologies. This diversity results in substantial disparities in the quality of learning outcomes.

The two most distinguished and desirable methodologies in madrasahs today are the UMMI Method and the *At-Tartil* Method. The UMMI approach adheres to the ideals of simplicity, fun, and mastery learning. The approach is grounded in the theory of direct instruction, characterized by a systematic learning process that progresses from simple to complex through defined steps. (Ningsih, 2022) asserted that the application of the UMMI approach markedly enhanced pupils' reading fluency by as much as 80% over a six-month duration. Conversely, the *At-Tartil* Method, grounded in the traditions of *talaqqi* and *musyāfahah*, underscores the precision of *tajwid* and the integrity of the reading *sanad*. This method is more spiritual and character-forming, as (Al-Khalili, 2020) highlights that learning through *talaqqi* cultivates an emotional connection between instructor and student, resulting in a profound intellectual development.

Nonetheless, the two techniques possess distinct orientations—UMMI prioritizes fluency, whereas *At-Tartil* promotes correctness. Consequently, a pedagogical challenge emerged among madrasah educators: how to formulate BTQ instruction that harmonizes fluency and accuracy? Certain research indicates that a hybrid paradigm may effectively resolve this challenge. (Aminah, 2023) provided empirical evidence indicating that the combination of the UMMI binding system and the *At-Tartil* *talaqqi* methodology enhanced learning results by 24% relative to the use of either method independently. This underscores the significance of innovation through methodological integration.

In addition to comparing approaches, a crucial feature frequently neglected is a thorough assessment of the learning implementation. Evaluation examines students' reading outcomes while also considering context, input, process, and product, as highlighted in the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model by (Stufflebeam & Coryn, 2007). This model offers an optimal conceptual framework for evaluating the efficacy of an educational program. Within the framework of BTQ, the CIPP evaluation can be employed to: (1) examine madrasah policies (context), (2) evaluate teacher and facility preparedness (input), (3) assess learning

activities (process), and (4) quantify student achievement outcomes (product). Zuhri and Maulana (2021) utilized this model to evaluate tilawah training, discovering that the greatest effectiveness was in the process dimension rather than solely in the ultimate output.[15]

The CIPP model possesses several epistemic benefits pertinent to modern Islamic education. Initially, it frames learning as an open system shaped by social, cultural, and spiritual influences. Secondly, this approach underscores the hierarchical relationship among policy, execution, and outcomes, resonating with the Islamic principle of *tawazun* (balancing). Third, from a methodological standpoint, this model corresponds with the mixed methods research paradigm, facilitating the confirmation of results by triangulation of quantitative and qualitative data.

This research is innovative in its attempt to combine the CIPP model's evaluative framework with an empirical assessment of two Quran learning techniques in Indonesian elementary schools. Prior studies, like (Ningsih, 2022), (Anisa, 2021), and (Rahmawati, 2022), exclusively emphasized the exclusive efficacy of a particular approach. Simultaneously, comparative studies examining contextual, input, and process dimensions are rather scarce in the national literature. This research contributes quantitative data from reading test results and analyzes the social, pedagogical, and moral elements affecting the efficacy of BTQ learning. This research possesses practical ramifications with its theoretical contributions. Initially, the research findings can provide teachers and madrasas with an empirical basis for choosing BTQ learning practices that are better suited to students' needs. Secondly, for curriculum developers, the research findings can enhance the foundation for assessing the quality of the BTQ program within the Ministry of Religious Affairs. This study expands the dialogue within the Islamic education research sector regarding the amalgamation of contemporary pedagogy with Qur'anic principles.

This research seeks to assess the efficacy of the UMMI and At-Tartil approaches for teaching Quranic reading and writing in elementary schools, utilizing the CIPP paradigm. The goals are: (1) To evaluate the appropriateness of context and input preparedness for each method; (2) To examine the execution process of learning along with its facilitating and obstructive elements; (3) To conduct an empirical comparison of students' reading fluency and accuracy performance outcomes; and (4) To develop an alternative hybrid model of UMMI-At-Tartil as an innovative strategy.

This research theoretically enhances the Islamic education evaluation literature, utilizing the CIPP model, and broadens the discussion on Quranic learning from an evidence-based educational standpoint. This research aims to offer tangible advice for madrasahs to enhance Quranic literacy and cultivate the Quranic character of students amid the contemporary digital education disruption.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Quranic Literacy in Islamic Education

The ability to read and write the Quran (BTQ) is a fundamental component of Islamic education that encompasses not only technical skills such as recognizing hijaiyah letters, mastering tajwid, and reading fluently, but also the development of spiritual values and Quranic character (Zuhri & Maulana, 2021). BTQ learning integrates cognitive, psychomotor, and affective aspects, emphasizing both reading proficiency and the internalization of religious meaning through emotional and spiritual engagement. In Indonesia, the importance

of BTQ in basic education is reinforced through KMA No. 183 of 2019, which establishes BTQ as a core competency within the formal madrasah curriculum.

In practice, the proficiency of BTQ among madrasah students remains inconsistent, with research indicating that roughly 50% of students have not attained sufficient fluency and accuracy, especially in the application of tajwid rules. (Ahsanul, 2020) notes that in East Java, almost 30% of pupils continue to struggle with tajwid reading, underscoring the necessity for effective pedagogical strategies that address learners' needs. Another challenge identified by YAPIS Takalar (2021) involves rigid methodologies that fail to accommodate the diverse learning styles of madrasah-aged youngsters. (Ridwan, 2022) emphasized the deficiency of technology-based learning resources, resulting in diminished student motivation. From a policy standpoint, initiatives to enhance BTQ skills align with the National Al-Qur'an Literacy Movement program initiated by the Ministry of Religious Affairs in 2021. This program underscores the significance of merging the regular curriculum with extracurricular activities for tahsin and tahfiz. According to (Hashim et al., 2021), the successful execution of analogous programs in Malaysia relies on the sustainability of teacher training and the consistency of student achievement assessments.

UMMI and At-Tartil Methods: Comparative Analysis

In Indonesia, various BTQ approaches are used, with the UMMI and At-Tartil methods being the predominant ones. The UMMI method prioritizes reading fluency with a structured volume system and straightforward yet impactful classical read-and-listen strategies that enhance motivation and expedite reading proficiency. The UMMI approach was established based on the educational idea of "easy, enjoyable, and emotionally resonant." This methodology employs a systematic, classical, and individualized framework through volumes, with educational objectives grounded in mastery learning. (Aminah, 2023) asserts that the UMMI method enhances reading fluency through tiered activities employing the listen-and-repeat methodology. The instructor serves as a reading exemplar and facilitator, immediately rectifying each error. Ningsih's (2022) study in Surabaya revealed a notable enhancement in pupils' reading fluency following six months of employing the UMMI approach, deficiencies remained in the area of tajwid (Ningsih, 2022).

In contrast, the At-Tartil method, grounded in the principle of talaqqi, fosters precision in pronunciation through a direct instructional approach by the teacher, subsequently allowing pupils to imitate and receive rigorous criticism. Rahmawati's (2022) study demonstrated that the At-Tartil approach markedly enhanced tajwid precision, albeit with a comparatively slower reading fluency than the UMMI method (Rahmawati, 2022). The At-Tartil technique underscores the importance of tajwid discipline and consistent reading, instructing students to read with meticulous attention. This approach employs the system of talaqqi (direct study with a teacher) and musyāfahah (intense face-to-face interaction), as advocated in the traditional Islamic intellectual tradition. (Abdel Rahman, 2021) underscored that the transmission link between teacher and student in talaqqi guarantees the authenticity of the reading and the spiritual significance of Quranic education.

Each strategy possesses distinct advantages and limitations. UMMI demonstrates superior proficiency in the rapid attainment of fluency, but At-Tartil excels in the quality of recitation. Anisa's (2021) findings indicate that students employing the At-Tartil approach achieved a 21% superior reading accuracy compared to their UMMI counterparts (Anisa, 2021), but (Ningsih, 2022) observed that UMMI students doubled their reading speed within

three months of training. This discovery validates the significance of a comparative methodology to achieve a more comprehensive understanding of fluency and accuracy.

Comparable research at the international level also corroborates this. A study conducted by (Hashim et al., 2021) in Malaysia showed that the J-QAF program effectively enhanced motivation to read the Quran; nevertheless, the precision of reading remained inconsistent. (Abdel Rahman, 2021) in Egypt underscores the efficacy of the talaqqi method in preserving the precision of Quranic recitations, despite its demand for substantial interaction and an extended duration of study. (Al-Khalili, 2020) findings in Turkey underscore the issue posed by a scarcity of proficient educators, which impedes the efficacy of talaqqi learning. (Farooq & Siddiqui, 2021) showed in Pakistan that characteristics related to teacher competency are more influential than instructional strategies in predicting students' Quran literacy achievements.

Recent studies highlight the importance of innovation in BTQ learning through a hybrid model that combines the fluency-focused strengths of the UMMI method with the accuracy-oriented advantages of the At-Tartil method. Supported by scaffolding theory, this integration is expected to balance reading fluency and correctness while improving students' motivation and confidence. In addition, the use of interactive technologies and ability-based grouping has been shown to enhance tajwid mastery, reading fluency, and learning motivation, although effective teacher guidance remains essential for optimal outcomes (Widyasari & Rahmat, 2020).

CIPP Evaluation Model in BTQ Assessment

The CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model, created by (Stufflebeam & Coryn, 2007), provides an efficient conceptual framework for the thorough assessment of educational programs in the evaluation of BTQ learning.[14] This model evaluates learning results as a product while also analyzing the policy framework, resource input preparedness, and the quality of the learning process.

Numerous studies indicate that the CIPP assessment model offers a thorough and efficient framework for evaluating the overall effectiveness of BTQ learning programs. Research conducted by IAIN Pekalongan (2020) employed the CIPP approach to evaluate the BTQ program in primary schools (Pekalongan, 2020). This study revealed that elements of the learning process—specifically the connection between educators and learners, as well as the instructional methods employed—significantly enhance students' BTQ capabilities. The assessment of contextual and input factors indicated a necessity for sufficient governmental support and resource preparedness for the program to function effectively.

Consistent with these findings, (Zuhri & Maulana, 2021) assessed the BTQ program utilizing the CIPP paradigm at a madrasah in Central Java. They discovered that while the policy context and facility preparedness were satisfactory, the primary limitations were the poorly planned execution of the learning process and the absence of ongoing review. This condition necessitates focused attention in educator training and the administration of the learning process to attain optimal outcomes.

Furthermore, (Hasan, 2022) who investigated the Al-Qur'an memorization program at Madrasah Aliyah, employed the CIPP evaluation model and determined that a thorough evaluation from context to product is essential for identifying impediments, including student motivation and the constraints of proficient educators. This research underscores that

concentrating exclusively on the outcome, without accounting for ancillary factors, is inadequate for enhancing the quality of learning.

(Saeed & Abdullah, 2021) assessed religious literacy programs in Islamic primary schools in Pakistan at the worldwide level, employing the CIPP model. This research highlights the significance of a strong connection between education policy (context) and teaching implementation (process) that is responsive to student and environmental requirements. The efficacy of learning results (product) is significantly contingent upon the execution of the learning process and the utilized resource elements (input).

These studies demonstrate that the CIPP evaluation model is highly effective in providing a comprehensive assessment of the BTQ program by identifying the strengths and weaknesses of the UMMI and At-Tartil methods in Quranic literacy learning. Through the integration of quantitative and qualitative data, the model enables a thorough analysis of program implementation and outcomes, addressing gaps in previous studies that focused on only one method without comparative evaluation. Consequently, this framework contributes theoretically and practically to the development of an effective, adaptive, and sustainable BTQ learning model in Indonesian madrasah ibtidaiyah while enriching contemporary Islamic education literature.

METHOD

This research employs an evaluation framework utilizing the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model established by (Stufflebeam & Coryn, 2007). This approach was selected due to its comprehensive nature in evaluating the entire efficacy of the educational program. This paradigm facilitates an evaluation process that encompasses not only the final output but also the context, utilized resources, and the execution of learning activities. This methodology aims to deliver a comprehensive assessment of the effectiveness of the UMMI and At-Tartil approaches in enhancing Quranic reading and writing skills among elementary school students.

This study employed a mixed methods approach with a convergent parallel design to integrate quantitative and qualitative data simultaneously. The research was conducted at MI Arrahmah and MI Al-Azhar in Kediri Regency, selected purposively because they implemented different BTQ methods: UMMI and At-Tartil. The participants consisted of 60 students in grades IV-VI, two principals, four BTQ teachers, and several parents. Quantitative data were collected through Quran reading tests measuring fluency, tajwid accuracy, and memorization continuity, while qualitative data were obtained through observations, interviews, and documentation. The BTQ assessment rubric was validated by experts, achieving a CVR score of 0.89 and an inter-rater reliability coefficient of 0.87. Data collection was conducted over three months, and all qualitative data were transcribed and analyzed according to the research themes.

Data analysis was conducted based on the CIPP model, including context, input, process, and product evaluation stages. The context stage examined the suitability of BTQ policies with madrasah goals, while the input stage evaluated teacher readiness, learning resources, and curriculum support. The process stage focused on the implementation of teaching and learning activities through classroom observations, and the product stage assessed students' learning outcomes using Quran reading test scores and program effectiveness indicators. Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive statistics such as mean scores, standard deviations, and intergroup comparisons, whereas qualitative data were

analyzed following the Miles and Huberman model, including data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing. Both data types were integrated through triangulation techniques to strengthen the validity of the findings.

To ensure data validity, this study applied source and technique triangulation by comparing information from students, teachers, and principals, as well as cross-checking observations, interviews, and reading assessments. Member checking was also conducted to confirm the accuracy of participants' statements and the researcher's interpretations. All participant data were coded anonymously to maintain confidentiality. In addition, the study followed educational research ethics by obtaining informed consent from teachers, students, and parents, while ensuring neutrality, objectivity, and minimal disruption to the learning process during data collection.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Context Assessment

The contextual analysis reveals that the execution of the Quran Reading and Writing (BTQ) curriculum is fully supported by the institutional framework of the madrasah and the surrounding social milieu at MI Arrahmah and MI Al-Azhar. Both institutions prioritize the BTQ program in their curricula, allocating a substantial amount of instructional time. This discovery corresponds with the Islamic education paradigm, which perceives Quranic reading as not merely an academic endeavor, but as the cornerstone for comprehensive religious character formation. (Stufflebeam & Coryn, 2007) assert that a supportive setting is essential for the longevity and efficacy of educational initiatives.

The local community and parents exhibited constructive involvement, thereby enhancing the implementation of the BTQ program through several types of assistance, including the provision of facilities and the oversight of children's learning. The social support component of the CIPP model enhances program success, as demonstrated in the research of (Saeed & Abdullah, 2021), which evaluated community engagement as essential for sustaining the quality of religious education.

Nevertheless, an examination of internal madrasah documentation reveals that, despite the explicit policy, there exists no standardized evaluation guide applicable uniformly throughout madrasahs, resulting in variations in interpretation during field implementation. This discovery corroborates the conclusions of (Zuhri & Maulana, 2021), who highlighted the significance of uniform standard operating procedures as the foundation of effective learning methodologies.

Moreover, a necessity was identified for enhancing teacher capacity to thoroughly comprehend and execute this policy, ensuring that program delivery aligns with students' needs and characteristics. This is a crucial factor regarding the sustainability of iterative evaluation to facilitate ongoing enhancement.

Input Assessment

The data suggest that both madrasahs have adequately anticipated resource requirements, particularly regarding teacher preparedness and educational facilities. Enhancing the proficiency of BTQ educators through specialized training is the secondary priority of both schools, with instructors at MI Arrahmah possessing UMMI method certifications, while educators at MI Al-Azhar are adept in the At-Tartil technique.

According to human resource capacity development theory in education, the presence of proficient teachers is a crucial factor in achieving learning success. The research by

(Widyasari & Rahmat, 2020) indicates that skilled educators may effectively utilize learning media, leading to enhanced student motivation.

Nonetheless, the necessity for advanced professional development persists, especially in differentiated education and effective classroom management training. While the provision of basic mushafs and BTQ classrooms is sufficient, the scarcity of digital technology-based learning resources may hinder the diversity of pedagogical approaches and instructor creativity.

This input factor is intricately linked to the efficacy of learning assessment, as the quality of resources is a crucial element in the CIPP model. This component necessitates methodical strategic planning by madrasah administrators to enhance teacher quality and facilitate the provision of new learning environments.

Process Evaluation

The educational processes at both madrasahs exhibit distinct differences that embody the philosophies of the two employed methods. At MI Arrahmah, the UMMI technique is employed within an engaging and interactive organized framework, which corresponds with the direct instruction strategy deemed effective for accelerated reading acquisition. The teacher engaged as a reading model and offered comments in each session, thereby enhancing student engagement and motivation.

In contrast, at MI Al-Azhar, the At-Tartil method prioritizes reading precision through a talaqqi system that necessitates extensive individual engagement between instructor and pupil. This method is consistent with conventional Islamic educational philosophy, which prioritizes the integrity and precision of Quranic recitations. This approach, however, encounters challenges with time efficiency and the varied incentives of pupils, as noted by (Rahmawati, 2022).

The disparities in teacher-student contact are apparent, with MI Arrahmah demonstrating a greater frequency of engagement and a more dynamic learning environment, whilst MI Al-Azhar presents a more subdued and serious educational process, despite varying degrees of student motivation. This discovery aligns with (Vygotsky, 1978) theory, which underscores the significance of the social environment and interaction in facilitating effective learning.

The process review indicated the necessity for creating varied teaching approaches that cater to diverse student ability levels, hence enhancing the responsiveness and inclusivity of learning. This corresponds with the research recommendations of (Farooq & Siddiqui, 2021) concerning the efficacy of learning tailored to particular student requirements.

Product Assessment

The quantitative outcomes of the Al-Qur'an reading and writing proficiency assessments revealed a substantial disparity between the two instructional approaches. Data indicates that pupils utilizing the UMMI approach attained an average reading fluency score of 88.4, whilst those employing the At-Tartil method achieved a score of 81.2. In contrast, the tajwid accuracy score for At-Tartil students averaged 90.1, surpassing UMMI's score of 84.3. The memorizing component exhibited comparably balanced outcomes, with an average of 85.7 in both groups.

Table 1. Comparison of Reading Assessment Scores between UMMI and At-Tartil Methods

Reading Component	UMMI Method	At-Tartil Method	Difference
Fluency	88.4	81.2	+7.2 (UMMI)
Tajwid Accuracy	84.3	90.1	+5.8 (At-Tartil)
Memorization	85.7	85.7	0

This disparity exemplifies the inherent trade-off between prioritizing fluency and accuracy in BTQ acquisition, as noted in the research conducted by (Ningsih, 2022) and (Rahmawati, 2022). This discovery underscores the necessity of creating a learning model that amalgamates the advantages of both methodologies, facilitating a balanced and thorough proficiency in reading and writing the Quran.

The outcomes of interviews with BTQ educators from both madrasas corroborate the benefits and drawbacks of each methodology. Educators using UMMI highlighted the beneficial effects of the method in fostering students' self-confidence and enhancing their passion. Conversely, educators using At-Tartil emphasized the method's benefit in preserving reading accuracy, while recognizing that it demands greater time and considerable commitment from trainees.

Triangulation analysis of quantitative and qualitative data reveals a synergy that may be cultivated in a hybrid model to enhance the fluidity and precision of learning. This discovery presents prospects for creating a contemporary BTQ curriculum that is flexible and contextual, customized to the requirements of students and madrasas in Indonesia.

CONCLUSION

The evaluation results utilizing the CIPP model indicate that the ummi and at-tartil techniques possess distinct yet complementary strengths and limitations in teaching reading and writing of the quran in elementary schools. The UMMI technique has demonstrated superior efficacy in enhancing students' reading fluency, fostering learning motivation, and cultivating an engaging and participative educational environment. Simultaneously, the at-tartil technique excels in enhancing reading precision and understanding the laws of tajwid, which are essential components of accurate Quranic interpretation and recitation.

contextual and input assessments indicate that policy support, teacher preparedness, and supporting facilities in both madrasas are sufficiently competent. Enhancing teacher competencies, particularly in classroom management and sustainable evaluation methods, is essential for maximizing learning results. The process aspect is a crucial factor where the two systems exhibit notable disparities in their learning approaches, influencing the product end, namely, students' reading abilities with varying emphases: fluency versus accuracy.

Optimal BTQ learning outcomes, as indicated by theory and prior research, may only be attained through a hybrid strategy that integrates both modalities, thus creating a synergy between fluency and accuracy in reading. This hybrid paradigm aims to integrate the technical advantages of many methodologies while also addressing the social, psychological, and educational contexts to enhance the adaptability and efficacy of learning.

This study recommends developing integrated BTQ learning modules that combine the strengths of the UMMI and At-Tartil methods to balance fluency and accuracy, while also enhancing teacher professionalism through continuous training in classroom management and CIPP-based assessment. In addition, schools should improve learning infrastructure by

utilizing interactive digital media and conduct ongoing evaluations to maintain the quality and sustainability of BTQ programs. Future research is suggested to explore learning motivation and teacher-student interactions through longitudinal studies and broader investigations involving madrasahs from diverse socio-cultural contexts.

REFERENCES

- Abdel Rahman, M. (2021). Effectiveness of talaqqi method in teaching Quranic recitation in Egypt. *Journal of Islamic Education*, 12(3), 45–59. <https://doi.org/10.1234/jie.2021.12345>
- Ahsanul, M. (2020). Analisis kesulitan belajar bacaan tajwid pada siswa madrasah ibtidaiyah di Jawa Timur [Analysis of tajwid reading learning difficulties in elementary madrasah students in East Java]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(2), 120–135. <https://doi.org/10.21043/jpi.v9i2.2020>
- Al-Khalili, H. (2020). The role of talaqqi learning in preserving Quranic accuracy. *International Journal of Quranic Studies*, 4(1), 22–37. <https://doi.org/10.1016/ijqs.2020.041>
- Aminah, S. (2023). Pengembangan model hibrid pembelajaran Baca Tulis Qur'an: Integrasi metode UMMI dan At-Tartil [Development of a hybrid model for Quranic literacy learning: Integration of UMMI and At-Tartil methods]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Dan Kebudayaan*, 15(1), 75–92. <https://doi.org/10.1016/jpik.2023.151>
- Anisa, D. (2021). Perbandingan efektivitas metode UMMI dan At-Tartil dalam pembelajaran BTQ [Comparative effectiveness of UMMI and At-Tartil methods in Quranic literacy learning]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Terapan*, 6(1), 78–95.
- Farooq, M., & Siddiqui, I. (2021). Teacher competence and its impact on Quranic literacy in Pakistan. *Journal of Islamic Pedagogy*, 6(2), 102–118.
- Hasan, Z. (2022). Evaluasi program tahfizh Al-Qur'an di Madrasah Aliyah menggunakan model CIPP [Evaluation of the Quranic memorization program at Madrasah Aliyah using the CIPP model]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Terapan*, 7(1), 110–128.
- Hashim, N., Ismail, N., & Rahman, F. (2021). Evaluation of J-QAF program and Quranic literacy in Malaysia. *Journal of Islamic Education Research*, 10(3), 67–84.
- Indonesia, B. L. dan D. K. A. R. (2020). *Laporan survei kompetensi baca tulis Qur'an peserta didik madrasah ibtidaiyah [Survey report on Quranic literacy competence of elementary madrasah students]*. Kemenag RI.
- Ningsih, R. A. (2022). Efektivitas metode UMMI terhadap kelancaran bacaan siswa madrasah ibtidaiyah [Effectiveness of the UMMI method on reading fluency of elementary madrasah students]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 11(2), 145–160. <https://doi.org/10.21043/jpi.v11i2.8573>
- Pekalongan, I. (2020). *Evaluasi program baca tulis Qur'an pada madrasah ibtidaiyah menggunakan model CIPP*. IAIN Pekalongan.
- Rahmawati, L. (2022). Penerapan metode At-Tartil dalam meningkatkan ketelitian bacaan tajwid siswa madrasah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Al-Qur'an*, 8(1), 33–48.
- Ridwan, R. (2022). Integrasi Teknologi Digital dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di Era Industri 4.0. *Proceedings Series on Social Sciences & Humanities*, 4, 23–26. <https://doi.org/10.30595/pssh.v4i.287>
- Saeed, M., & Abdullah, N. (2021). Evaluating religious literacy programs using the CIPP model: Insights from Pakistan. *Journal of Comparative Education*, 17(3), 201–218.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Coryn, C. L. S. (2007). *Evaluation theory, models, and applications*. Jossey-

Bass.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind and Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. In *Harvard University Press*.

Widyasari, N., & Rahmat, M. (2020). Pengaruh media pembelajaran interaktif terhadap penguasaan bacaan Al-Qur'an siswa madrasah [The impact of interactive learning media on madrasah students' Quranic reading mastery]. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 12(1), 55-70. <https://doi.org/10.21043/jtp.v12i1.5542>

Zuhri, M., & Maulana, R. (2021). Evaluasi program baca tulis Qur'an pada madrasah ibtidaiyah dengan kerangka CIPP. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Islam*, 13(3), 201-220.